ACCESS TO INFORMATION ON THE POSTING OF WORKERS

Construction Companies' Practices and Challenges

Sonila Danaj, Kristina Toplak, and Mojca Vah Jevšnik (eds.)

ACCESS TO INFORMATION ON THE POSTING OF WORKERS: CONSTRUCTION COMPANIES' PRACTICES AND CHALLENGES

Edited by Sonila Danaj, Kristina Toplak, Mojca Vah Jevšnik

Expert Reviewers
Marina Lukšič Hacin, Sanja Cukut Krilić

Language Editor
Jana Wilcoxen

Design
Deja Gliha

Issued by
ZRC SAZU Slovenian Migration Institute

Represented by
Marina Lukšič-Hacin

Published by
Založba ZRC

Represented by
Oto Luthar

Založba ZRC Editor-in-Chief
Aleš Pogačnik

Ljubljana 2024

Cover photo by gpointstudio on Freepik

Except otherwise noted, the reuse of this **e-book** is authorised under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International (CC-BY 4.0) licence (https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).
This means that reuse is allowed provided appropriate credit is given and any changes are indicated. For any use or reproduction of elements that are not owned by the authors, permission must be sought directly from the copyright holders.

https://doi.org/10.3986/9789610508366

Kataložni zapis o publikaciji (CIP) pripravili v Narodni in univerzitetni knjižnici v Ljubljani
COBISS.SI-ID 186021123
ISBN 978-961-05-0836-6 (PDF)

General contact: Sonila Danaj [danaj@euro.centre.org]

For more information on the publication:
Kristina Toplak kristina.toplak@zrc-sazu.si and Mojca Vah Jevšnik mvah@zrc-sazu.si

Please refer to this publication as follows:
Danaj, S., Toplak, K. & Vah Jevšnik, M. (eds.) (2024). Access to Information on the Posting of Workers. Construction Companies' Practices and Challenges. Ljubljana: Založba ZRC. https://doi.org/10.3986/9789610508366

Information may be quoted provided the source is stated accurately and clearly.

Co-funded by
the European Union

This publication is part of the INFO-POW project. This project has received funding by the European Commission, DG Employment, European Social Fund+ (ESF+) Social Prerogatives and Specific Competencies Lines (SocPL), Call ESF-2021-POW.

Views and opinions expressed are, however, those of the author(s) only and do not necessarily reflect those of the European Union or European Commission, DG Employment, ESF+ and SocPL. Neither the European Union nor the granting authority can be held responsible for them.

ACCESS TO INFORMATION ON THE POSTING OF WORKERS: CONSTRUCTION COMPANIES' PRACTICES AND CHALLENGES

Edited by Sonila Danaj, Kristina Toplak, and Mojca Vah Jevšnik

Ljubljana 2024

CONTENTS

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS 7

INTRODUCTION
Sonila Danaj 9

THE CROSS-NATIONAL MIXED METHODOLOGY APPLIED IN THE BOOK: MAPPING AND EVALUATING INFORMATION CHANNELS ON POSTING
Elif Naz Kayran, Eszter Zólyomi, and Sonila Danaj 18

ACCESS TO INFORMATION ON THE POSTING OF WORKERS: COMPANY PRACTICES AND CHALLENGES IN THE CASE OF AUSTRIA
Sonila Danaj, Elif Naz Kayran, and Eszter Zólyomi 36

ACCESS TO INFORMATION ON THE POSTING OF WORKERS: COMPANY PRACTICES AND CHALLENGES IN THE CASE OF BELGIUM
Lynn De Smedt and Frederic De Wispelaere 54

ACCESS TO INFORMATION ON THE POSTING OF WORKERS: COMPANY PRACTICES AND CHALLENGES IN THE CASE OF ITALY
Rossana Cillo and Fabio Perocco 69

ACCESS TO INFORMATION ON THE POSTING OF WORKERS: COMPANY PRACTICES AND CHALLENGES IN THE CASE OF SLOVAKIA
Alexandra Moran and Lucia Mýtna Kureková 87

ACCESS TO INFORMATION ON THE POSTING OF WORKERS: COMPANY PRACTICES AND CHALLENGES IN THE CASE OF SLOVENIA
Mojca Vah Jevšnik and Kristina Toplak 104

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS
Sonila Danaj 120

ABOUT THE AUTHORS 129

ANNEX 1: INTERVIEW PROTOCOL 135

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1: Content on posting to/from Austria 42

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1: Types of included and excluded information channels 24

Table 2: Key themes and indicators used for the information mapping exercise 26

Table 3: Overview of the semi-structured interviews conducted with information providers 28

Table 4: Types of content and tools applied by specific actors 92

Table 5: Overview of challenges experienced by user/posting undertakings and information providers 97

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

The authors would like to thank the associated partners, namely the European Builders Confederation (EBC), the European Construction Industry Federation (FIEC), the European Federation of Building and Woodworkers (EFBWW), the Flemish Federation of Construction SMEs (Bouwunie), the regional Italian Association of Enterprises in Vincenza (Confindustria Vicenza), the Slovak Chamber of Commerce and Industry (SOPK), the Confederation of Trade Unions of the Slovak Republic (KOZ SR), the Slovak National Labour Inspectorate (NLI RS), and the Employment Service of Slovenia (ESS) for their support in the implementation of the research for the INFO-POW project.

We would like to thank all the experts from the national institutions, social partners, and private actors for accepting our request to share their knowledge and experience in the provision of information on the posting of workers and for their support with the distribution of the survey to the targeted audiences in Austria, Belgium, Italy, Slovakia, and Slovenia. For the Austrian study, our gratitude goes to the experts at the Federal Ministry of Labour and Economy, the Federal Ministry of Finance, the Austrian Federal Chamber of Commerce and the regional Chambers of Commerce of Carinthia and Tyrol, the Construction Workers' Annual Leave and Severance Pay Fund (BUAK), the Austrian Health Insurance Fund, the Federation of Social Insurances, and a private law company. For the Belgian study, we thank Embuild and Bouwunie for sending the online survey to their members and the interviewees from Bouwunie, ABVV, ACV, NSSO, and a payroll consultancy. For the Italian study, our gratitude goes to the representatives of the Italian Association of Construction Companies (ANCE), Confindustria Vicenza, the National Bilateral Construction Industry Board (CNCE), the Friuli Venezia Giulia Region, and a financial and labour consultancy. For the Slovakian study, we are grateful to the interview respondents, participants in the online stakeholder consultation workshop, and supporters of the dissemination of the pilot online survey: job portal Profesia.sk, the National Labour Inspectorate, Slovenský živnostenský zväz (Slovak Craft Industry Federation), Zväz stavebných podnikateľov Slovenska (Association of

Construction Entrepreneurs of Slovakia), and the Central European Labour Studies Institute. For the Slovenian study, our gratitude goes to the Ministry of Labour, Family, Social Affairs and Equal Opportunities of Slovenia, the Employment Service of Slovenia, Chamber of Commerce and Industry of Štajerska, the Health Insurance Institute of Slovenia, and the Chamber of Craft and Small Business of Slovenia.

In addition, we would like to thank the participants in the online stakeholder workshop held on 19 January 2023 for their feedback on the mapping exercise and survey manuscript and the participants in the final upscaling event that was held on 17 January 2024 in the premises of the European Labour Authority in Bratislava, Slovakia. We also thank Yo Gazia (KU Leuven) for setting up the survey online and distributing it to the Orbis enlisted construction company contacts. Thank you also to the national teams of the INFO-POW consortium (European Centre for Social Welfare Policy and Research, HIVA – Research Institute for Work and Society, KU Leuven, Ca' Foscari University of Venice, CSPV Slovak Academy of Sciences, the Research Centre of the Slovenian Academy of Arts and Sciences) for managing the translation of the survey to national languages and for its distribution at the national level.

We are particularly grateful to the respondents who took the time to answer the survey, thus giving us a window into their companies' practices, challenges, and needs and sharing their experience-based recommendations.

ABOUT THE AUTHORS

Rossana Cillo is a research fellow at the University of Venice and a PhD candidate at the Université Libre de Bruxelles. Her research interests are migrant work, the unionisation of migrant workers, and the posting of workers. Her recent publications include "Mandatory mobility? The case of immigrant posted workers sent from Italy to Belgium in the construction sector", *International Migration*, 2021 and *Posted Workers*, Edizioni Ca' Foscari, 2022, co-edited with Fabio Perocco.

ORCID: 0000-0001-6219-593X

Sonila Danaj is the team leader of the Employment and Labour Mobility Research Team at the European Centre for Social Welfare Policy and Research. Her thematic expertise includes labour mobility and migrant labour, in particular, posted work and temporary agency work; labour and social rights, working conditions, occupational health and safety; third-country nationals labour migration and posting; the interplay between EU and national employment and mobility legal and policy frameworks; monitoring and enforcement of labour standards; industrial relations and social partners engagement with labour mobility and migration policy and/or migrant workers. She has been managing and acting as a researcher for multiple transnational projects on the posting of workers and third-country labour migration. Her work has been published by Oxford University Press, ETUI, *International Journal of Human Resource Management, Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies*, *International Journal of Sociology and Social Policy*, and *European Labour Law Journal*.

ORCID: 0000-0002-0582-7125

Lynn De Smedt is a senior researcher at HIVA-KU Leuven who works on the topic of the welfare state. She is active in the Network Statistics FMSSFE on the free movement of workers, social security coordination and fraud and error, set up by the European Commission, DG Employment, Social Affairs and Inclusion. This network of experts collects and analyses statistics and administrative data on the intra-European free movement of persons, European coordination of social security, and the constraint of fraud and error. Furthermore, she is involved in the EU project POSTING. STAT, which brings together a consortium of universities and research centres from 11 different Member States to enhance the collection, analysis, and reporting of administrative micro-data on intra-EU posting.

ORCID: 0000-0002-6398-5412

Frederic De Wispelaere is a research expert at HIVA-KU Leuven. His main research fields are intra-EU labour mobility, EU coordination of social security systems and (cross-border) social fraud. He is a member of the Network Statistics FMSSFE on the free movement of workers, social security coordination and fraud and error, a research network set up by the European Commission to collect and analyse statistics on those three fields covering all EU/EFTA countries and the UK. He coordinates the EU project POSTING.STAT, which brings together a consortium of universities and research centres from 11 different Member States to enhance the collection, analysis, and reporting of administrative micro-data on intra-EU posting.

Elif Naz Kayran is a researcher at the European Centre for Social Welfare Policy and Research in the Employment and Labour Mobility unit. Previously, she was a post-doctoral researcher at Leiden University and a pre-doctoral fellow at Nuffield College and the Department of Politics & International Relations at Oxford University, funded by the Swiss National Science Foundation (SNSF). Elif holds a PhD in Political Science from the University of Geneva and the Geneva Graduate Institute (IHEID). Her research lies at the intersection of comparative political economy, migration and citizenship studies, and political behaviour and public opinion. She also works on topics related to the role of politics and civil society on immigrant rights, ethnic gaps in political mobilisation and voting rights for foreigners, social inclusion of migrants, and EU labour mobility. Some of her work has appeared in *Political Behavior, European Political Science Review*, *Journal of European Social Policy*, and *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies.*

ORCID: 0000-0002-5804-0625

Lucia Mýtna Kureková is a senior researcher at the Centre of Social and Psychological Sciences, Institute for Forecasting of the Slovak Academy of Sciences (SAS). She has widely published in recognised international journals, including *Migration Studies*, *Journal of Ethnic and Migration Studies* and *Journal of Common Market Studies*. Her migration research focuses on various aspects of intra-EU mobility, including return migration and posting of workers, as well as the role of institutions in labour migration and labour market integration of immigrants in the EU. She has participated in several international collaborative research projects (STYLE, NEUJOBS, POW-BRIDGE, INFO-POW, ISKILL, PACES). In addition to academic work, she regularly provides expertise to international organisations, including ILO, OECD, and the World Bank. Mýtna Kureková is the leader of the INFO-POW project team at the Institute for Forecasting of SAS.

ORCID: 0000-0002-5038-7931

Alexandra Moran is a junior researcher at the Institute for Forecasting at the Slovak Academy of Sciences in Bratislava. She received her bachelor's and master's degrees in law from Tilburg University (the Netherlands). During her studies in Labour Law and Employment Relations, she focused on interdisciplinary research on precarious work in the cultural and creative industries. Moran conducts research on labour mobility and migration at the Institute for Forecasting.

ORCID: 0009-0009-0341-0228

Fabio Perocco is an associate professor of sociology at the University of Venice, the coordinator of the Laboratory for Social Research, a member of the editorial board of the series Migration, Diasporas and Citizenship (Palgrave-Macmillan), Migration politics (Angeli), and the journal *Travail, Emploi, Formation*, and the editor-in-chief of *Inequalities* journal. His research interests are inequalities, migration, racism, and work transformations. Some recent publications: *Migration and Torture in Today's World*, Edizioni Ca' Foscari, 2023; "The Racialized Welfare Discourse on Asylum Seekers and Refugees", *Social Sciences*, 2023; *Racism in and for the Welfare State*, Palgrave, 2022; and *Environmental Racism and Health Inequalities*, PM, 2022.

ORCID: 0000-0003-0991-0046

Kristina Toplak is a research fellow at the Research Centre of the Slovenian Academy of Sciences and Arts in Ljubljana and assistant professor at the Faculty of Arts, University of Maribor. Due to her longstanding interest in fine arts, many of her research ideas and endeavours are connected to arts, migration, and mobility. She has conducted extensive fieldwork in Argentina, Germany, Australia, Norway, and Slovenia. She is the author of the monograph *"Buenas artes": Creativity of Slovenians and their Descendants in Buenos Aires* (2008; in Slovenian). Currently, she focuses on the aspects of labour migration/mobility, focusing on posted workers and cross-border workers. She is the co-editor (with Mojca Vah Jevšnik) of two books, *Labour Mobility in the EU* (2018) and *Further Discussions on Labour Mobility in the EU* (2023).

ORCID: 0000-0001-7972-1481

Mojca Vah Jevšnik is a research associate at the Research Centre of the Slovenian Academy of Sciences and Arts and an assistant professor at the University of Nova Gorica. Her main fields of research are labour migration and mobility, with a particular interest in the mobilities of (health)care workers, social welfare policy, and the intra-EU posting of workers. She is a lecturer and coordinator of the Erasmus Mundus graduate study programme EMMIR (European Master in Migration and Intercultural Relations).

ORCID: 0000-0001-8388-7804

Eszter Zólyomi is a researcher in the Social Protection and Inclusion unit at the European Centre for Social Welfare Policy and Research. Her research focuses on empirical analysis of social and gender inequalities, poverty and non-monetary aspects of well-being, evaluation of social protection programmes and their impact on different social groups with a specific focus on a European comparative perspective. Her other research interests include migration and labour mobility within the EU. Her expertise in research methodologies is focused on statistical analysis of large-scale cross-sectional microsurvey data. Her work has been published in the *Journal of European Social Policy, European Journal of Ageing*, and *PLOS ONE*.

ORCID: 0000-0003-0175-6646

ANNEX 1: INTERVIEW PROTOCOL

Introductory protocol

Welcome: Thank you for agreeing to do this interview. My name is [XY], and I'll be talking with you today.

Inform about the research and explain purpose of the interview: Our research project on how transnational posting undertakings and user undertakings find and use information in their interaction with national institutions and how that affects their overall performance in terms of the correct application of the posting rules and the protection of labour and social standards. The study focuses on the specific case of the construction sector as the main sector where posting occurs, and where both larger companies and SMEs as well as self-employed are active.

The purpose of this interview today is to learn more about your experiences with and recommendations related to access and use of publicly available information for posting construction companies and user undertakings The interview will last about 45-60 minutes.

Obtain informed consent:

[Ask interviewee to read and sign the informed consent form] Participation in this interview is voluntary and everything you tell us will be confidential. We won't connect your name with anything you say. Do you have any questions regarding the consent form?

To facilitate our notetaking, we would like to audio tape our conversations today. For your information, only researchers on the project will have access to the tapes. The information provided will be used only for the purposes of the study and the related research products that will be derived from it. Is it OK if I audio tape this interview today?

If yes: Thank you! Please let me know if at any point you want me to turn off the recorder or keep something you said off the record. You can stop the interview at any time for any reason.
If no: Thank you for letting me know. I will only take notes of our conversation.

[FOR TELEPHONE/TELECONFERENCE: Participant will be sent an informed consent form before the interview. At start of interview, ask if participant has read the consent form and if she/he has any questions about the consent form and if he or she agrees to be interviewed and audiotaped]

Before we start the interview, do you have any questions? [Discuss questions] If any questions (or other questions) arise at any point during this interview you can feel free to ask them at any time. Let me know if during the interview there are any questions that you would rather not answer. Please remember that we want to know what you think and that there are no right or wrong answers.

Introduction/Background
I'd like to begin by asking you some questions about your current job.

Probe: What is your position at [institution/organization]? What are your major responsibilities in your current position? How long have you been with [institution/organization]?

Can you tell me a bit about your work and experience as it relates to the posting of workers?

Probe: particularly for aspects that relate to information dissemination for posting/user undertakings.

Now, let's talk about your organisation.

What is your organisation's experience with engaging posting/user undertakings (or with the topic of posting of workers in general)?

- What prompted your organisation to get involved in this issue?
- Specifically, what activities have you undertaken?

Information provided to posting/user undertakings: content, tools, sources, intra-institutional exchange, dissemination

1 What information have you created and/or delivered?

1.1 What types of content do (did) you disseminate?
    - Probes: working time, OSH, minimum wages and CBA, registration for social insurance and contributions, work permits, taxation, over time and other additional wage supplements, leave and holidays, facilitating information targeted at companies, sanctions and enforcement in case of non-compliance, redress, appeal and compensation.

1.2 What tools or resources have you used?
    - Probes: online channels (webpages, online workshops, tutorial, videos), offline tools (booklets, brochures, regular consultation hours)

1.3 What are your sources for the information about posting provided by your organization? Or where did you go to look for information?

1.4 Do you exchange with other national or EU institutions/organizations on posting information? (in what form/frequency, with whom)

1.5 At what frequency do you update/provide/deliver information on the topic?

2 How do (did) you disseminate information to posting/user undertakings?

2.1 What channel(s) or mode of delivering information do (did) you use? (Online and/or offline channels e.g. website, flyers, brochures, guides, trainings, workshops, videos etc.)

2.2 How do (did) you engage posting/user undertakings? Do you provide any support with interpreting/decoding the provided information?

- Probe: Is there a contact email or contact number in case of questions? Do you have office hours? Do you provide content with answers to Frequently Asked Questions?

Monitoring and enforcement of the provision of information

3 What has been the reaction to your activities/efforts?

3.1 Do you map how well a particular information source/channel is able to reach the respective target group (e.g. web page view counts, number of participants at an event)?

4 How do you ensure that your information reaches respective employers? Do you take any specific measures? Which ones? Do they work?

4.1 Do (did) this differ for different types of posting employers/user undertakings?

4.2 If so, what are the different types, and how do their information needs differ?

5 Was there anything you did that you thought worked well?

5.1 Among the topics that you have addressed or considered addressing, what types/aspects of information seem to resonate most with posting employers/user undertakings?

5.2 What aspects resonate least?

5.3 What do you think are the priority topics and content areas for posting/user undertakings?

- With what topics do they need the most assistance?
- Where can information affect the most change?

6 What, if anything, would you do differently?

Gaps and Challenges in the provision of information

7 In your view, what are the pertaining information gaps that posting companies continue to face? What is the reason for these information gaps?

7.1 What opportunities for information dissemination/engagement have not traditionally been used?

7.2 Are there target audiences that have been ignored?

7.3 Are there any differences on information gaps between posting undertakings and user undertakings?

8 What barriers/challenges would you say posting/user undertakings face when accessing information on the posting of workers?

- Probe: this could in more general terms, or the information provided by the specific institution/organization.

9 What challenges are there to providing information to posting/user undertaking?

- Probe: this could in general, or about the specific institution/organization.

Best practices and recommendations

10 What are the best ways to inform/engage posting/user undertakings?

10.1 Based on your knowledge/experience which is the organization that currently best delivers information on posting? What best practices do they have?

10.3.1 What facilitates those best practices?

10.3.2 What are some challenges to those best practices?

10.1 What are the best way(s) to disseminate information?

- Probe: perhaps they can elaborate on what they consider the best way.
- Probe: perhaps they can mention any best practices in making information available and accessible for posting and user undertakings?

10.1.1 How feasible is this/are these?

10.1.2 What assistance would be needed to implement such tools and resources? What are the best ways to sustain those efforts?

11 Can you recommend any particular print documents or Web resources that your or other institutions/organizations have produced that we should review?

Closing the interview

12 What is the most important message that you want us to take away from this interview?

12.1 Is there anything else that you would like to add about any of the topics that we've discussed or other areas that we didn't discuss but you think are important?

12.2 If you know of any research, tools, or resources that may be useful to include please send them to me.

Thank you for your time and participation in this interview. The information that you provided to us will be very helpful in this project.