

Critical Report

SOURCES

THE sources of the three Masses presented in this edition are three early seventeenth-century codices, part of a collection of six well-preserved choirbooks known today as the Hren choirbooks.¹ These manuscripts, originating from Graz, nowadays form part of the Manuscript Collection at the National and University Library in Ljubljana – they are shelfmarked MSS 339–344. The source for the edition of the *Missa Aller mi fault* is MS 339, of the *Missa Stabunt justi* MS 340 and that for the edition of the *Missa Andra la nave mia* is MS 341.

As has been explained in the previous two volumes of the *Selected Works from the Hren Choirbooks*, the precise date of the choirbooks' arrival in the Ljubljana library remains uncertain. However, it is highly probable that they were transferred to the Lyceal Bibliothek, a precursor of the National and University Library, following the reforms of Joseph II in the late eighteenth century. These reforms led to the acquisition of the episcopal archives from Gornji Grad.² Notably,

1. The principal studies of the Hren choirbooks are Ger- not Gruber, "Magnifikatkompositionen in Parodietechnik aus dem Umkreis der Hofkapellen der Herzöge Karl II. und Ferdinand von Innerösterreich", *Kirchenmusikalisches Jahrbuch* 51 (1967): 33–60; Janez Höfler, "Gornjegrajska glasbena zbirka in inventarij ljubljanskega stolnega kora iz leta 1620", in *Glasbena umetnost pozne renesanse in baroka na Slovenskem* (Ljubljana: Partizanska knjiga, 1978), 32–35; Edo Škulj, *Hrenove korne knjige* (Ljubljana: Družina, 2001); Metoda Kokole, "From Graz to Today's Central Slovenia: The Influence of Italian Polychoral Music in the Period c. 1595 to c. 1620", in *La musica policorale in Italia e nell'Europa centro-orientale fra Cinque e Seicento / Polychoral Music in Italy and in Central-Eastern Europe at the Turn of the Seventeenth Century*, edited by Aleksandra Patalas and Marina Toffetti, TRA.D.I.MUS., Studi e monografie 1 (Venice: Edizioni Fondazione Levi, 2012), 335–374; and Klemen Grabnar, "Parodične maše v Hrenovih kornih knjigah" (PhD diss., Univerza v Ljubljani, 2015).

the choirbooks are absent from the library inventories of the late eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, which would suggest a later accession. However, since none of these inventories is a complete listing of library items, they do not argue for a later date of accession. Nevertheless, the codices were undoubtedly in the library's possession by the late nineteenth century, as evidenced by Ferdinand Bischoff's reference to them in his 1889 article on music in Styria, in which he mentioned their presence there.³

As mentioned above, the assumption is that these manuscripts came to the Lyceal Bibliothek from the collection of the Prince-Bishop Hren's palace in Gornji Grad (he was the Bishop of Ljubljana from 1597 to 1630). There are two main reasons for this supposition. First, the former owner of at least two of the choirbooks, but as likely as not of all six, was Bishop Tomaž Hren (Thomas Chrön). In MS 341 we find a flyleaf with Bishop Hren's coat of arms and his motto plus name written at the top and bottom of the page, respectively.⁴ The other volume once indubitably in his possession is MS 344, which contains a dedication stating that the volume was presented to Hren in 1616 by Karl Kuglmann, son of the Graz court bass singer and music scribe Georg Kuglmann (fl. 1579–1613), who had written out the choirbook.⁵

2. See Janez Höfler and Ivan Klemenčič, introduction to *Glasbeni rokopisi in tiski na Slovenskem do leta 1800: katalog / Music Manuscripts and Printed Music in Slovenia before 1800: Catalogue* (Ljubljana: Narodna in univerzitetna knjižnica, 1967), 12–13.

3. Ferdinand Bischoff, "Beiträge zur Geschichte der Musikpflege in Steiermark", *Mittheilungen des historischen Vereines für Steiermark* 37 (1889): 98–166.

4. The flyleaf is reproduced in black and white in the first volume of the *Selected Works from the Hren Choirbooks* (facsimile 4), and in colour on the backcover of Škulj, *Hrenove korne knjige*.

5. See the reproduction of the relevant folio in Kokole, "From Graz to Today's Central Slovenia," 348.

Second, if Hren had kept the choirbooks in Ljubljana, they would very likely have been listed in the “*Inventarium librorum musicalium ecclesiae cathedralis Labacensis*”, a catalogue of the Ljubljana Cathedral’s *musicalia*, which had been compiled between 1620 and 1628 by order of Hren himself.⁶

Missa Aller mi fault

The sole source of Simone Gatto’s *Missa Aller mi fault* is MS 339, a large codex, measuring 56.5 × 38 cm without covers and 59 × 41 cm with covers. The manuscript, lacking a title page, is composed of 591 folios of good-quality paper, unaffected by ink corrosion, making the contents entirely legible.

The codex retains its original leather-over-wood binding in dark brown leather. The binding is decorated with blind impressions. The spine has six convex double bindings that divide the spine into seven sections. The book once had clasps, of which only two thin metal plates on the edge of the back cover and two metal pins on the edge of the front cover have survived (the movable part of the clasps – the leather straps and the clasp – have not survived). Since the choirbooks of Graz origin from the same period today preserved in the University of Graz Library (Universitätsbibliothek Graz; A-Gu) display similar blind-tooled bindings, and since there were bookbinders active in Graz, MS 339 and all the other Hren codices, including MSS 340 and 341 (see below), were most probably bound in that city.⁷ Although we do not know who actually bound the Hren choirbooks, this may well have been the work of Georg Wagner, who in 1610, for instance, received payment for binding Kuglmann’s choirbooks.⁸

6. Cf. Jurij Snoj, *Zgodovina glasbe na Slovenskem*, vol. 1, *Glasba na Slovenskem do konca 16. stoletja* (Ljubljana: Založba ZRC, 2012), 367. More on the “*Inventarium librorum musicalium ecclesiae cathedralis Labacensis*”, see Höfler, *Glasbena umetnost pozne renesanse in baroka na Slovenskem*, 36–41 and 134–157.

7. See, for example, A-Gu, MS 8. A portion of this choirbook was likewise copied by Georg Kuglmann.

8. Hellmut Federhofer, *Musikpflege und Musiker am Grazer Habsburgerhof der Erzherzöge Karl und Ferdinand von Innerösterreich (1564–1619)* (Mainz: B. Schott’s Söhne, 1967), 96.

The codex has no originally inscribed folios and was foliated in pencil in modern times. Two folios are missing between folios 157 and 158, so that the Sanctus and Agnus Dei movements of the *Missa Ut re mi fa sol la* by Jacobus de Kerle are incomplete. Folio 422 was also incomplete, but was supplemented during the restoration by part of one of the last folios of the codex, which is also missing. Thus, at the end of the *Missa quinti toni* by Giovanni Matteo Asola there is a part of the end of the *Missa octo vocum* by Alard du Gaucquier. The manuscript was clearly not complete, as the (vocal) pieces on folios 294–389 and 452–591 are without text.

The choirbook MS 339 contains thirteen Magnificat settings for five to six voices followed by eighteen Masses for four to eight voices, all ordered according to the ascending number of voices. This manuscript is especially important on account of the five *unica* it contains: a Magnificat by a hardly known *Kleinmeister*, Bartholomeus Damitz; a *Missa Magne pater Augustine* by a little-known Italian composer from Lucca, Theodorus Leonardus; a *Missa Pastores quid nam vidistis* (based on the homonymous motet of Clemens non Papa) by the *Kapellmeister* in Vienna, Jean Guyot de Châtelet; and a *Missa Aller mi fault* (based on Willaert’s similarly named chanson) by the Graz *Kapellmeister* Simone Gatto, presented in this edition; and a *Missa Osculetur me* by Orlando di Lasso. This codex is probably the best-known one among the Hren choirbooks, since it contains this *unicum*. For a certain length of time the *Missa Dulce me mori* (based on Sandrin’s famous chanson *Doulce memoire*) by Ippolito Chamaterò, who was active mostly in northern Italy, was likewise regarded as a *unicum*. This Mass was printed in Chamaterò’s *Liber primus missarum* (Venice: Scotto, 1569), and the only specimen of this collection was formerly reported as missing; however, it was rediscovered about a decade ago.⁹ The composer of this Mass preserved in MS 339 has hitherto been regarded as unknown – a consequence of the erroneous

9. Jeffrey Kurtzman and Anne Schnobelen, *A Catalogue of Mass, Office, and Holy Week Music Printed in Italy, 1516–1770*, JSCM Instrumenta 2, accessed 13 April 2015, <http://sscm-jscm.org/instrumenta/vol-2/>. In the *Liber primus missarum* the Mass is titled *Missa ad Illustrissimum Parmae et Placentiae Ducissam*.

transcription of his surname (as Lammaterus instead of Cammaterus).¹⁰

Although the copying of MS 339 has been attributed to Georg Kuglmann alone,¹¹ three further scribal hands are discernible.¹² The copying of MS 339 was clearly begun by the first scribe (Scribe A), who was responsible for entering the Magnificats. A different hand, that of Kuglmann, took over to copy the first four Masses. A third hand (Scribe B) then copied most of the next Mass, towards the end alternating with Kuglmann. After that, Kuglmann copied another Mass alone. The next Mass (Palestrina's *Missa L'homme armé* for five voices) stands apart from the rest; it is in a completely unrelated hand (Scribe C). Scribe B took over to copy the next Mass. There follow four more Masses, including Gatto's *Missa Aller mi fault*, all copied by Kuglmann. The next Mass was copied by Scribe A. The remainder of the manuscript is all in Kuglmann's hand. It is known that beside Kuglmann there were other scribes among the musicians at the Graz court.¹³ However, none is mentioned as being a music scribe in the *Hofkammerakten*. Therefore, the identity of other scribes (Scribes A–C) remains unknown. The system of division between Scribe A, Scribe B and Kuglmann is interesting; it appears that they worked in close collaboration and were therefore contemporaries, while the watermark of the Palestrina layer (a circle enclosing the letter K) shows this part of the codex to be a little older.¹⁴

The title of the Mass is written on a separate page, i.e. title-page. Thus, on fol. 336r the title reads "Miffa. a. 5. Super | Aller mi fault: | Simonis

Gatto." (see facsimile 1). After this, the music is written on fols. 336v–357r.

Missa Stabunt justi

As in the case of the previous Mass, the sole source of the *Missa Stabunt justi* is one of the Hren choirbooks, namely MS 340, likewise a large choirbook, measuring 56 × 39.5 cm without covers and 58 × 42 cm with covers. It has no title page. Instead, there is an inscription "Georgii Kuglmann gehörig" on the top of the first folio, denoting the first owner. The manuscript is, as MS 339, written on good-quality paper that has mostly escaped damage from ink corrosion, making all the folios more or less perfectly legible and usable. It contains 295 folios with original foliation. The codex retains its original leather-over-wood binding in white leather which is blind-tooled.¹⁵

The choirbook MS 340 is a collection of twelve settings of the Ordinary of the Mass ordered according to the descending number of voices, from eight to four voices. Three *unica* appear in this manuscript: a *Missa Benedicite omnia opera Domini* by the Graz organist Annibale Perini; a *Missa Quanto in milli anni in ciel* (based on Nallet's madrigal) by Bartolomeo Spontone, active in northern Italy; and Gatto's *Missa Stabunt justi*.

On fol. 2r there is a table of contents – "Index Missarum huius libri"¹⁶ – listing the title, composer and initial folio number of each Mass. In MS 340 two hands are in evidence. The volume is divided fairly equally between Georg Kuglmann and another, so far unidentified scribe (Scribe A).¹⁷ The two men evidently alternated regularly: one copied the first Mass, the other the second Mass, and so forth. Gatto's *Missa Stabunt justi* was copied by the unidentified scribe. This Mass has, as in the case of the *Missa Aller mi fault*, a title-page, which is actually written in Kuglmann's hand. The title on this page is found on fol. 189r and reads: "Miffa A5 super | Stabunt iufti. | Simon Gatto" (see facsimile 3). After this, the music with its text, both copied by Scribe A, is written on fols. 189v–211r. At the top of fol. 189v is the

10. See Škulj, *Hrenove korne knjige*, 14 and 40. Although Gruber ("Magnificatkompositionen in Parodietechnik", 203–204; Kokole, "From Graz to Today's Central Slovenia", 340n24.) transcribed the surname correctly, his transcription went unnoticed.

11. Gruber, "Magnificatkompositionen in Parodietechnik", 203–204; Kokole, "From Graz to Today's Central Slovenia", 340n24.

12. The Graz court bass singer Georg Kuglmann was active as a scribe at least from 1587 until his death in 1613 or 1616. For a list of the principal studies, see earlier, note 1. See also Federhofer, *Musikpflege und Musiker*, esp. 95–97. For more information on different scribal hands present in the Hren choirbooks, see Klemen Grabnar, "From Graz to Ljubljana? Towards Discovery of the Origin of the Hren Choirbooks", *De musica disserenda* 11 (2015): 211–227.

13. See, for example, Federhofer, *Musikpflege und Musiker*, 163.

14. See Grabnar, "From Graz to Ljubljana?", 224–225.

15. Cf. the description of MS 339 above.

16. The folio is reproduced in black and white in the first volume of the *Selected Works from the Hren Choirbooks* (facsimile 1).

title “Missa super: Stabunt iufti.” and at the top of fol. 190r is found the name of the composer: “Simon Gatto” (see facsimile 4).

Missa Andra la nave mia

Gatto’s *Missa Andra la nave mia* is sourced from MS 341, another large choirbook, measuring 55 × 35 cm without covers and 57 × 38 cm with covers. Like MSS 339 and 340, it lacks title page. Instead, as mentioned above, there is a flyleaf with Bishop Hren’s coat of arms, his motto and name, indicating the former owner. The manuscript is rather well preserved, although some folios are missing at the start. Of the originally marked 467 folios, 448 have survived to this day. The music thus begins on fol. 22 with the incompletely preserved Sanctus from Jacob Regnart’s *Missa Exultandi tempus est*.¹⁸ The codex has a similar binding to MS 340 (see above).

The book MS 341 contains eighteen Magnificat settings and eighteen Masses ordered in alternation and descending from ten to five voices, plus a few responses for four voices. This codex is, next to MS 339, probably also well-known one among the Hren choirbooks, since it contains a *unicum* by Orlando di Lasso: a *Magnificat septimi toni* for ten voices (LVanh 75). At the beginning is a list of the Masses and at the end a list of the Magnificats contained therein.

Three scribes contributed to MS 341.¹⁹ The music of the first twenty-two compositions, including Gatto’s *Missa Andra la nave mia*, was copied by Kuglmann, while the text was entered by the same unidentified hand as in MS 340 (Scribe A), appearing also in MS 339. Interestingly, both the music and the text of the altus on fol. 242 are the work of Scribe A. The next piece (both text and music) was copied by Kuglmann, but at the end of the piece Kuglmann and Scribe A alternate, each entering the text on a single page, one after the other. The next section of the manuscript was copied by Kuglmann. After that, a few responses in falsobordone style are written in a hand completely different from the others (Scribe D). The

remainder of the manuscript is once again in Kuglmann’s hand. From this collaborative effort in manuscript production, we can therefore deduce that there probably existed a scribal workshop in Graz responsible for copying and compiling the Hren choirbooks.

Gatto’s *Missa Andra la nave mia* is written on fols. 94v–111r of MS 341 and has no title page. At the top of fol. 94v is the title “Missa a8 Andra la nave mia” and at the top of fol. 95r is found the name of the composer: “Simon Gatto” (see facsimile 5).

This Mass is also part of two other choirbooks of Graz origin – A-Gu, MSS 22 (fols. 2v–26r) and 82 (fols. 92r–109r)²⁰ – both entirely in Kuglmann’s hand. While it is preserved in its entirety in the former, only the music for the first choir is preserved in the latter. Kuglmann dedicated the choirbook MS 22 to the Jesuits in Graz in 1602 and the codex MS 82 to prominent personalities of the diocese of Seckau in 1607, each pair of pieces (a Mass and a Magnificat) to a different person. The latter shows the same organization as the MS 341 from Ljubljana and contains a very similar repertoire, and even some of the compositions are identical.²¹

EDITORIAL METHODS

In this edition the original note values have been retained, except for final notes, written as longae in the original sources, which are transcribed as appropriate note values, usually breves, with a fermata. Barlines are inserted through each staff, with the brevis forming the bar. Double barlines are used to delineate sections within a Mass movement.

All Masses, bearing the signature C , are transcribed in $\frac{4}{2}$ metre. Proportional signatures indicating triple metre (e.g. $\text{C} \frac{3}{2}$) – shown above the uppermost staff in the transcription with the equivalence indicated – are represented by their modern equivalents (e.g. $\frac{3}{4}$).

17. See the description of MS 339 above; Grabnar, “From Graz to Ljubljana?”, 214–225.

18. The folio is reproduced in black and white in the first volume of the *Selected Works from the Hren Choirbooks* (facsimile 5).

19. See Grabnar, “From Graz to Ljubljana?”, 214–225.

20. An electronic copy of the manuscripts is available at <https://unipub.uni-graz.at/urn/urn:nbn:at:at-ubg:2-30332> and <https://unipub.uni-graz.at/urn/urn:nbn:at:at-ubg:2-27952>, respectively.

21. See Klemen Grabnar, “Uglasbitev kantika magnifikat Simoneja Gatta na primeru skladbe *Magnificat primi toni*”, *Muzikološki zbornik* 59 (2023): 138.

Ligatures are shown by closed brackets over the staff, whereas colouration is indicated by broken brackets. Longer coloured sections that cause movement in triplets are marked by a change of metre.

Since the original designations of the vocal parts are missing, these have been normalized to cantus, altus, tenor and bassus and enclosed in brackets. The original clefs (indicated at the beginning of each composition, together with the musical incipit) are replaced by modern clefs in accordance with the range of each voice.

Accidentals in the original have been scrupulously preserved, all editorial suggestions for additional accidentals being placed above the relevant notes. Accidentals on the staff that appear in brackets have been added by the editor whenever repetitions of the same pitch extend over a barline in the transcription and only the first note in the series has an accidental in the original. If an original or bracketed accidental on the staff is no longer valid when the same pitch is repeated later in the same bar, it is cancelled with a bracketed sign whenever the source itself does not indicate cancellation.

The edition normally retains text spellings (e.g. “coelis”), with the exception of the words “Iesu”, “iudicare” and “iusti” where initial consonantal “is” have been replaced by “js” (“Jesu”, “iudicare” and “justi”). Abbreviations in the original text have been resolved, and textual repetitions, shown by the idem sign, have been placed in italics. Capitalization and punctuation have been normalized, as has also the distinction between “u” and “v”.²² Ligatures are not retained. Missing text has been enclosed in brackets.

CRITICAL NOTES

Abbreviations:

- b(b). bar(s)
C cantus
A altus
T tenor
B bassus

Pitches are named in octave groups ranging from C to B. Octaves are signified in accordance with the so-called Helmholtz system, which names the C two octaves below middle C great C, then c, c¹ (for middle C), c² and so forth.

[1] Missa Aller mi fault

GLORIA

- b. 25, T I: note 2 has a flat symbol

[2] Missa Stabunt justi

KYRIE

- b. 49, C: “chri” below the last note

GLORIA

- b. 94, B: semibrevis rest before the note redundant
b. 108, B: first two notes are semibreves

CREDO

- b. 27, C: semibrevis rest before the minim rest redundant
b. 50, T I: “ctum” below the last note
bb. 86–87, T II: last note of b. 86 and first note of b. 87 are both b
b. 88, C: semibrevis rest before the last note redundant
b. 111, T I: note 2 is c¹
b. 176, C: first note is a minim and second note is a semibrevis
b. 189, T I: note 3 is f¹
b. 197, T I: “pe” below the first note

SANCTUS

- bb. 27–50, A: written in C4 clef
b. 39, A: brevis rest missing
b. 64, A: last note is c¹

AGNUS DEI

- b. 3, C: accidental under note 2
b. 27, B: last note is c

22. For example, see Christian Dostal, Johannes Berchmans Göschl, Cornelius Pouderoijen, Franz Karl Praßl, Heinrich Rumphorst and Stephan Zippe, eds., *Graduale novum*: Editio magis critica iuxta SC 117, vol. 1, *De dominicis et festis* (Regensburg: ConBrio Verlagsgesellschaft; [Rome:] Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 2011); *Antiphonale Romanum in canto gregoriano ad exemplar ordinis cantus officii dispositum*, vol. 2, *Ad vespas in dominicis et festis* (Solesmes: Abbaye Saint-Pierre, 2009).

vum: Editio magis critica iuxta SC 117, vol. 1, *De dominicis et festis* (Regensburg: ConBrio Verlagsgesellschaft; [Rome:] Libreria Editrice Vaticana, 2011); *Antiphonale Romanum in canto gregoriano ad exemplar ordinis cantus officii dispositum*, vol. 2, *Ad vespas in dominicis et festis* (Solesmes: Abbaye Saint-Pierre, 2009).

[3] Missa Andra la nave mia

KYRIE

- b. 1, B I: one “e” below the last note redundant
- b. 2, A I: one “e” below note 2 redundant
- b. 39, C II: “tr” below the first note redundant

GLORIA

- bb. 52–54, C I: underlay is “facta sunt”

CREDO

- bb. 33–34, A I: two semibreves instead of a brevis

SANCTUS

- b. 35, C II: first note is a minim